**Revised Criticism**

**Online Changes - Done**

**What already has been changed in a former online version as well as in the recently uploaded excel file (except for some problematic deals)**

| **Deal** | **Target country** | **Comments by public** | **Note GIGA** | **Online change** | **Date of change** | **Public database effect** | **Excel file** | **Comments** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 712 | Argentina |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 106 | Cambodia |  | In principle nothing wrong. But failed deals cause trouble – misunderstandings. Are taken out until we have the new online LM database. Filtered the excel LM: State as Reported = 3. The following 74 cases were identified. Effect on public database: 34 cases made invisible. | Has failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 | out | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 107 | Cambodia |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 | out | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 1142 | Cameroon | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | Petrus criticism is not justified. Case 1142 seems to be right. Maybe there has not yet been a contract signed and definitely construction has not began yet. But the company enounced publicly, that they are planning investing in a 300,000 area in Cameroon. There are various articles reporting on this. State as reported is correctly listed as 1 (pending) in the matrix. Implementation status has not yet been entered.  Following links seem to belong to another case concerning Benin: http://www.srfood.org/images/stories/pdf/officialreports/20100305\_a-hrc-13-33-add3\_country-mission-benin\_en.pdf, http://www.fondation-farm.org/IMG/pdf/foncier\_benin.pdf, <http://www.farmlandgrab.org/post/view/13717>  Case 1142 should stay in the matrix, but maybe it’s reliability should be downgraded to 0 because the entry is just based on news articles;  Wrong links should be removed;  Additional links should be added: http://www.ft.com/cms/s/0/290c6a52-42ad-11e0-8b34-00144feabdc0.html#axzz1x0QZXuXM ; http://www.businessgreen.com/bg/news/2028963/sime-darby-plans-gbp12bn-sustainable-palm-oil-expansion-cameroon ; http://www.reuters.com/finance/stocks/SIME.KL/key-developments/article/2423825 |  |  |  | Reliability=0; links removed/added |  |
| 1144 | Cameroon | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Petrus criticism seems to be justified. Jianjun Wang is the director of Sino-Cam IKO Ltd, which is a local company of the subsidiary company of Shaanxi State Farm. Hence 1144 is a double entry of 1140. Source confirming this: http://www.camereco.com/article.php?aid=472 | deleted | 30.05.2012 | out | “Case deleted” = 1  Link of 1144 added  (🡪References (temp), column C) |  |
| 1159 | Cameroon | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red block: “Incorrect area values”); Comment: “73,068 ha has been acquired” (LM: 100000) | Diverging information: As the company itself says, it “plans to develop an agro-industrial project (…) comprising of (…) up to 100 000 hectares (…)” (1159\_3:6) and effectively 73068 ha were granted (1159\_2: x) resp. “The entire Project site covers *approximately* 73,086 ha of land” (ibid. xii). According to the RSPO (Roundtable on Sustainable Palm Oil) Summary Report of Planning & Management SG Sustainable Oils Cameroon, “The total area of the concession (…) is approximately 69,975 ha” (1159\_8: 1). I couldn’t verify this since I have not found the complete convention; the extracts I found on the internet apparently do not specify the size of the concession.  The size of investment should be left open (with a remark that information diverges) or be given approximately. |  |  |  | Area size changed to 73068 (remark added that it is planned to expand up to 100000 ha) |  |
| 810 | Colombia |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 812 | Costa Rica |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 817 | Costa Rica |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 1127 | Côte d'Ivoire | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | I think Petrus criticism (These are not plantation projects - they are smallholder oriented jatropha and rubber project supported by the state) is justified. Furthermore case 1127 seems to be an investment by APROCANCI (Association des Producteurs de Caoutchouc Naturel en Cote d’Ivoire) not ADERCI. It seems to be a smallholder oriented project and it is definitely an association from Cote d'Ivoire and supported by the state. Additionally I do not find any official sources verifying the size of the investment. Just one article is reporting about this investment.  Following links seem to belong to another case concerning Benin: http://www.srfood.org/images/stories/pdf/officialreports/20100305\_a-hrc-13-33-add3\_country-mission-benin\_en.pdf, http://www.fondation-farm.org/IMG/pdf/foncier\_benin.pdf, <http://www.farmlandgrab.org/post/view/13717>  Case 1127 should be deleted or at least the investor's name should be changed and the reliability should be downgraded to 0. |  |  |  | Reliability=0; investor name changed; links removed | What about smallholder oriented projects? |
| 1128 | Côte d'Ivoire | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | I think Petrus criticism (These are not plantation projects - they are smallholder oriented jatropha and rubber project supported by the state) is justified. Furthermore case 1128 seems to be an investment by APROCANCI (Association des Producteurs de Caoutchouc Naturel en Cote d’Ivoire) not ADERCI. It seems to be a smallholder oriented project and it is definitely an association from Cote d'Ivoire and supported by the state. Additionally I do not find any official sources verifying the size of the investment. Just one article is reporting about this investment.  Following links seem to belong to another case concerning Benin: http://www.srfood.org/images/stories/pdf/officialreports/20100305\_a-hrc-13-33-add3\_country-mission-benin\_en.pdf, http://www.fondation-farm.org/IMG/pdf/foncier\_benin.pdf, <http://www.farmlandgrab.org/post/view/13717>  Case 1128 should be deleted or at least the investor's name should be changed and the reliability should be downgraded to 0. |  |  |  | Reliability=0; investor name changed; links removed | What about smallholder oriented projects? |
| 2185 | Côte d'Ivoire | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | I think Peturs criticism (Nauve only purchased a minority share in a long-established company) is justified. Only the source (Report of FIAN) on which the entry in the matrix is based on, states that Nauvu took over the whole area of SIFCA Group (Cote d'Ivoire based company). All other articles states that Nauvu just invested in a 25% share of the SIFCA Group. Sources confirming this: http://www.wilmarinternational.com/news/press\_releases/20071221%20-%20Nauvu%20Press%20Release.pdf ; http://www.consultancyafrica.com/index.php?option=com\_content&view=article&id=540:singaporean-investment-greasing-the-wheels-of-ivory-coasts-palm-oil-industry&catid=58:asia-dimension-discussion-papers&Itemid=264.  The area size of case 2185 needs to be deleted. |  |  |  | Area size deleted (former given size: 96000) |  |
| 1167 | Democratic Republic of the Congo |  | Information received from Mathieu: “Concerning the South African case in Congo Brazza (COG), that is to say acquisition by AgriSA (unique ref number in the LM 1167). The reliability ranking is 0. However Ward visited the operations last month in Congo. The contract, of which we have a copy, mention a first share of 80 000 with extension to 200 000 ha. The corn production already started on 1500 ha and it will be sold on the local market (already a price agreement). They have employed local people (I can ask ward about the number of Jobs). I strongly recommend to update this case.” Email Mathieu 29.05.2012 | Reliability 0 to 3 | 30.05.2012 | in | Reliability changed to 3  Mathieu’s remark regarding investment size added  Information added: 1. Domestic partners (state)  2. former landowner (state)  3. former landuse  4. remark regarding size added  New source (1167\_7) and resp. link added (🡪References (temp), column G) |  |
| 1984 | Democratic Republic of the Congo | * This deal represents 35% of the surface reported for the DRC, but it is very doubtful whether it actually exists. All sources on the deal you cite go back to unverified press reports. Please see the discussion in Deborah Brautigam's blog at <http://www.chinaafricarealstory.com/2010/03/china-and-african-land-grab-drc-oil.html>   While I know how difficult it is to establish the truth about news releases, I hope that most material on the database is more carefully evaluated. By the way, two of the web sources cited no longer exist.  Gregor Dobler  [gregor.dobler@ethno.uni-freiburg.de](mailto:gregor.dobler@ethno.uni-freiburg.de)   * I hope other data are more rigorously checked... This has long been clear to be a bogus. See: http://www.chinaafricarealstory.com/2012/04/zombie-chinese-land-grabs-in-africa.html http://ruralmodernity.wordpress.com/2012/04/27/the-land-matrix-much-ado-about-nothing/   Article by Rural Modernity on the investor ZTE  <http://ruralmodernity.wordpress.com/2012/05/03/the-facts-about-zte-in-dr-congo/>  Petrus  [ruralmodernity@gmail.com](mailto:ruralmodernity@gmail.com)   * Deborah Brautigam   [dbrauti@american.edu](mailto:dbrauti@american.edu)  Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (red block: “Incorrect area values”); **comment**: “100,000 ha was acquired” | “unverified press reports”: How to react on this? Press reports ARE the kind of sources we use and we decided to attribute a reliability ranking of 1 to cases “simply” reported in the press….  Sources:  Links not yet possible to edit but search results are:   * WB Link (2nd last) retrieved: http://siteresources.worldbank.org/EXTARD/Resources/336681-1236436879081/5893311-1271205116054/MpoyiPresentation.pdf * Link to CPL blog not recovered… Delete (?) * The company’s statement: <http://www.zte-e.com/en/prod_js.aspx?ID=738> * Petrus argumentation: <http://farmlandgrab.org/post/view/20429>   Bogus/Failed deal criticism (repeated by others!):  Editing of variables “CONTRACT STATUS” and “IMPLEMENTATION STATUS” not yet possible but results so far:  In database “STATE AS REPORTED = 2”, i.e. contract completed. Result of source check:   * “Contract signed” according to GTZ Report. Add link: GTZ. 2009a. “Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) in Land in Developing Countries”. Division 45, Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development, Bonn. * “Contract pending” according to all other sources, even more recent ones than GTZ report. * Additional search on contract status: blog by Deborah Brautigam and others. Result to my mind: There has been a MoU (i.e. contract signed, right?) but we don’t know on how many hectares etc. and it seems that the implementation has not started yet. How to classify the deal and how to communicate this? GENERAL QUESTIONS REGARDING STRATEGY ON FAILED DEALS * The company itself talks about 10 ha. | Reliability 1 to 0 | 21.05.2012 | out | Reliability changed to 0 |  |
| 1989 | Democratic Republic of the Congo | Submitted by Brent (not verified) on Mon, 21/05/2012 - 4:41pm.  How can this one not be deleted yet?? It’s the biggest rubbish entry. The author was referring to the ZTE deal, which doesn’t exist of that magnitude. Kindly remove this one asap. It is severely misrepresenting the severity of the Congo land grabs. | Big deal over 200000 hectares checked by Mathieu  Source not reliable | Reliability: 1 to 0 | 18.05.2012 | out | Reliability changed to 0 |  |
| 1991 | Democratic Republic of the Congo |  | Duplication of 2038 | Deleted | 18.05.2012 | out |  | Really duplicates? (different target countries and investor information) |
| 1995 | Democratic Republic of the Congo | “This is a smallholder reforestation project, not a plantation project” (see : excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx”, dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | Information received from Mathieu: "In fact, this is a plantation made on a land that belongs for very long time ( ) to the owner of this company who is also a tribal chief. So, even if it`s a legal concession (because this is the rule in DRC), this is de facto a private property with a title deed." This is not an acquisition realized after 2000" Email Mathieu 29.05.2012 | deleted | 30.05.2012 | out | “Case deleted” = 1 |  |
| 2011 | Democratic Republic of the Congo |  | Big deal over 200000 hectares checked by Mathieu  This is gas prospection in open see. | Deleted | 18.05.2012 | No effect (R0) | “Case deleted” = 1 |  |
| 2016 | Democratic Republic of the Congo |  | Big deal over 200000 hectares checked by Mathieu  Just an interview of a governor but no deals | Deleted | 18.05.2012 | No effect (R0) | “Case deleted” = 1 |  |
| 1190 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of case 1189  Case 1189 should be kept, and case 1190, 1253 and 2186 should be deleted. As I understood it Acazis leased 56,000 ha, on which they cultivate crops on 13,000 ha. So it is just one project in Oromia Region State. Furthermore Acazis AG, was formerly named Flora Ecopower, which is a spin-off company of the Israeli Hovev Group. This is why case 1253 and 2186 should be deleted. | deleted | 30.05.2012 | out | “Case deleted” = 1  **Following information was transferred from case 1190 to case 1189:**  “Nature of the Investment”: “A (Agrofuels)” changed to “D (Non-food agricultural commodities)”  “Processing/Use of Produce 3”: “CPP” added.  “Produce Exported”: “No” deleted. |  |
| 1194 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) ;  FIAN: error concerning the name of investor | Only one link accessible. The link does not really coincide with the data in the MATRIX. I cannot find additional sources in the internet.  The reliability of case 1194 should be downgraded to 0. |  |  |  | Reliability=0 |  |
| 1205 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | 1207, 1209, 1210, 1212, 1214, 1307, 1314 and 2223 are duplications of 1205. Contract on this case found in one of the duplicate entries.   * Following links should be added:   + <http://farmlandgrab.org/uploads/attachment/Karuturi-Agreement.pdf> (contract)   + <http://www.ethiopianreview.com/pdf/001/The-Ethiopia-Macroeconomic-Handbook-2010.pdf>   + http://www.karuturi.com/index.php?option=com\_content&task=view&id=32&Itemid=90 | R1 to R3 | 30.05.2012 | No effect | Reliability changed to 3  Links added (see above) |  |
| 1206 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of 1208; See documentation Siri | deleted | 30.05.2012 | out | “Case deleted” = 1  Information from 1206 transferred to 1208:  Concerning specific location; produce exported to investor country/other country; water extraction; former landuser/landuse (category A added); compensation; local involvement  PDFs/links from 1206 added (🡪References (temp), columns E & F) |  |
| 1207 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of 1205 | deleted | 30.05.2012 | No effect (R0) | “Case deleted” = 1  Link from 1207 transferred to 1205 (🡪References (temp), column J) |  |
| 1209 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of 1205 | deleted | 30.05.2012 | No effect (R0) | “Case deleted” = 1  Links from 1209 transferred to 1205 (🡪References (temp), columns K, L and M)  Remark regarding duration of the lease added (40-99 years; Lease periods vary)  Information added from 1209 (produce exported to Djibouti and Kenya; respective remark also added) |  |
| 1210 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of 1205. | deleted | 24.05.2012 | out | “Case deleted” = 1  Links added (🡪References (temp), columns E, F and G) |  |
| 1212 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of 1205 | deleted | 30.05.2012 | No effect (R0) | “Case deleted” = 1 |  |
| 1214 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of 1205 | deleted | 30.05.2012 | No effect (R0) | “Case deleted” = 1 |  |
| 1219 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of 1229 | deleted | 30.05.2012 | out | “Case deleted” = 1  No information/links needed to be transferred |  |
| 1220 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of 1221 | deleted | 24.05.2012 | out | “Case deleted” = 1  Links added (🡪 References (temp), columns J and K) |  |
| 1223 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | Just the source the entry is based on (GLP Report) states that the Indian government has invested in an area of 1,000,000 in Ethiopia. I cannot find any other source confirming this.  Maybe the reliability of case 1223 should be downgraded to 0. (GLP Report seems to be at least partially only based on newspaper articles). |  |  |  | Reliability=0 |  |
| 1224 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of 1222.Case 1224 should be deleted. |  |  |  | Case deleted=1; information added |  |
| 1225 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of 1222. Case 1225 should be deleted. |  |  |  | Case deleted=1, information added |  |
| 1237 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | Al-Amoudi is the owner of Saudi Star. Case 1237 is a double entry of case 1244.  Case 1237 should be deleted. |  |  |  | Case deleted=1; information added |  |
| 1239 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Case 1239: the origin country of the investor was wrong, the investor's name was spelled wrongly and 1239 together with 1220 was a double entry of 1221. | deleted | 30.05.2012 | out | “Case deleted” = 1  Link added (🡪 References (temp), column L) |  |
| 1240 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | 1240 is a double entry of 1241. Horizon Ethiopia and Horizon Plantation are the same. 1240 should be deleted. |  |  |  | Case deleted=1; information added |  |
| 1241 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | 1240 is a double entry of 1241. Horizon Ethiopia and Horizon Plantation are the same.  1241 should be kept in the matrix, but the investor's name should be changed to "Horizon Plantation Ethiopia PLC", the area size should be changed to 250,000 ha and the implementation status should be downgraded. |  |  |  | investor's name changed to "Horizon Plantation Ethiopia PLC"; area size changed to 250,000; implementation status changed (=2) |  |
| 1248 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of 1244; See documentation Siri | deleted | 30.05.2012 | out | “Case deleted” = 1  PDF/Link from 1248 added (🡪References (temp), column F) |  |
| 1249 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | There are different information available in various articles. I would argue that it only seems to be sure that the company obtained an area of 10,000 ha and is planning to increase there investment to up to 500,000 ha.  Reliability ranking of case 1249 should be downgraded to 0. |  |  |  | Reliability=0 |  |
| 1253 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of case 1189; See case 1190 | deleted | 30.05.2012 | out | “Case deleted” = 1 |  |
| 1257 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”)  Specific criticism: Same as National Biodiesel entry above | Duplication of 1201; Petrus criticism is justified: Sun Biofuels owns 80% of National Biodiesel (source: document 1201\_1 or link:http://www.foeeurope.org/sites/default/files/publications/FoEE\_Africa\_up\_for\_grabs\_0910.pdf ). Case 1257 should be deleted |  |  |  | Case deleted =1;  Information added; source added |  |
| 1274 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | On the official homepage it is stated that the company has a 50,000 ha project in Ethiopia, region Dire Dawa.  The size of case 1274 should be changed to 50,000 ha, the region should be changed to Dire Dawa and following additional link should be added: http://agropeace.com/pages/projects.html |  |  |  | Size changed from 80000 to 50000; region changed; link added |  |
| 1275 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of case 1275.  I would argue that case 1280 and 1275 are a duplication of case 1284. Global Energy Ethiopia is a subsidiary company of Global Energy Pacific, which to me seem to be from the US. But different sources list Global Energy Ethiopia as coming from different countries, like Lebanon or Israel. | deleted | 30.05.2012 | out | “Case deleted” = 1  Information from 1275 and 1280 transferred to 1284: specific location; state as reported and implementation state; nature of the deal; crop (CST); use of produce 2 (OIL); domestic use/product exported; benefits; remark regarding investor added  PDFs/links from 1275 and 1280 added (🡪References (temp), columns C & D) |  |
| 1280 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of case 1284 | deleted | 30.05.2012 | out | “Case deleted” = 1 |  |
| 1283 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | On the official homepage it is stated that the company is planning to cultivate 50,000 ha in Ethiopia, Region Amhara.  The size of case 1283 should be changed to 50,000 ha and the implementation status and state as reported should be downgraded to 1. Furthermore following link should be added: http://biomassive.andrewmacpherson.za.net/index.php?option=com\_content&task=view&id=18&Itemid=30. |  |  |  | Size changed to 50,000 ha (former size: 100000); implementation status and state as reported changed to 1 (former state as reported=2; former implementation status=4); link added |  |
| 1289 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red block: “Incorrect area values”); **Comment:** “40,000 ha acquired” (LM: 50000) | The source is indeed imprecise since it states “Land Size Obtained/required (ha)” = 50000 (stand: Sep 2008). I have not found any other information concerning that deal.  Petrus was asked about his source, his answer was: “My information is based on official AISD and EIC datasets, which due  to their confidentiality I am unable to share, but am happy to tell you when you are right or wrong” |  |  |  | I left it the way it is |  |
| 1295 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”)  Specific criticism: Same as National Biodiesel entry above | Duplication of 1200; Petrus criticism is justified: Sun Biofuels owns 80% of National Biodiesel (source: document 1200\_1 or link:http://www.foeeurope.org/sites/default/files/publications/FoEE\_Africa\_up\_for\_grabs\_0910.pdf ). Case 1295 should be deleted | Taken out (Tin) | ? (“last changes” by Tin) | out | Case deleted =1;  Information added (country of investor 2; datasource) |  |
| 1298 | Ethiopia | <http://www.chinaafricarealstory.com/2012/04/zombie-chinese-land-grabs-in-africa.html>  Huh? This proposed joint venture is not "Chinese" but South African-Chinese-Ethiopian, and was listed in an Ethiopian database in 2008 as in the "pre-implementation" phase. It has never been implemented | The case is correctly listed in the MATRIX as a South African-Chinese-Ethiopian joint venture.  But the contract in the MATRIX is listed as completed, while the only source the entrance is based on lists the deal as being in pre-implementation.  I do not find more information in the internet.  State as reported of case 1298 should be changed to 1. |  |  |  | State as reported changed to 1 |  |
| 1307 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of 1205 | deleted | 30.05.2012 | out | “Case deleted” = 1  Link from 1307 added (🡪References (temp), column N) |  |
| 1313 | Ethiopia |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 1314 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of 1205 | deleted | 30.05.2012 | No effect (R0) | “Case deleted” = 1  Remark regarding the distribution of produce added  Links from 1314 added (🡪References (temp), columns Q and R) |  |
| 1315 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of 1229 | deleted | 30.05.2012 | No effect (R0) | “Case deleted” = 1  No information/links needed to be transferred |  |
| 2186 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of 1189; See case 1190 | deleted | 24.05.2012 | out | “Case deleted” = 1  **Following link was transferred from case 1798 to case 1189:** <http://farmlandgrab.org/post/view/18118> (-> References (temp), column E) |  |
| 2222 | Ethiopia |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 2223 | Ethiopia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of 1205 | deleted | 30.05.2012 | No effect (R0) | “Case deleted” = 1 |  |
| 1325 | Ghana | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | 1325 and 2240 are a double entry of 2241. Various newspapers and the Friends of the Earth Report state that Scanfuel obtained an area of 400,000 ha, I cannot find the information which Petrus claims to be right (option for 303,750 ha). But all information the entry is based on are just articles and the Friend of the Earth Report (reliable??)  Case 1325 should be deleted. |  |  |  | Case deleted=1 |  |
| 1337 | Ghana |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 1348 | Ghana |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 2238 | Ghana |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 2240 | Ghana | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | 1325 and 2240 are a double entry of 2241. Various newspapers and the Friends of the Earth Report state that Scanfuel obtained an area of 400,000 ha, I cannot find the information which Petrus claims to be right (option for 303,750 ha). But all information the entry is based on are just articles and the Friend of the Earth Report (reliable??)  Case 2240 should be deleted. |  |  |  | Case deleted=1 |  |
| 2241 | Ghana | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | 1325 and 2240 are a double entry of 2241. Various newspapers and the Friends of the Earth Report state that Scanfuel obtained an area of 400,000 ha, I cannot find the information which Petrus claims to be right (option for 303,750 ha). But all information the entry is based on are just articles and the Friend of the Earth Report (reliable??)  2241 should be kept in the matrix, but maybe the reliability should be downgraded to 0. |  |  |  | Reliability=0 |  |
| 580 | India |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 594 | India |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 606 | India |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 625 | India |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 627 | India |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 633 | India |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 655 | India |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 171 | Indonesia |  | Big deal over 200000 hectares checked by Mathieu  Source not reliable | Reliability: 1 to 0 | 18.05.2012 | out | Reliability changed to 0 |  |
| 1365 | Kenya | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | No link does work and I do not find other sources in the internet.  The reliability of case 1365 should be downgraded to 0. |  |  |  | Reliability =0 |  |
| 1371 | Kenya |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 1373 | Kenya |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 1374 | Kenya | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (red block: “Incorrect area values”); Comment: “17,000 acres, not hectares” (LM: 17500 ha) ; | Diverging information: all reliable sources (1374\_6-12, and apparently the company itself, see 1374\_6: 22) state that the concession accounts for **6900 ha**. However one report (1374\_10) that refers to the Memorandum of Understanding between Siaya County Council, Bondo County Council and Dominion Farms, says that **6000** ha are claimed (see 1374\_10: 23). 17500 ha is the (estimated) size of the swamp region. It is probably often cited because, as several sources indicate, the company “intends to reclaim the entire swamp of 17,500ha” (1374\_10: 23) and the boundaries “of the Dominion project are not clear” (1374\_12: 2), resp. “a possibility of extension” (1374\_11: 9) is given.  Size should to be corrected: 6000 or 6900 ha instead of 17500 (6900 ha equates to 17000 acres). |  |  |  | Size changed from 17500 ha to 6900 |  |
| 1386 | Kenya | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | No link does work and I do not find other sources in the internet.  The reliability of case 1386 should be downgraded to 0. |  |  |  | Reliability =0 |  |
| 2246 | Liberia | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | The GIZ report, the entry is based on, confirms the information (area size of 17.000 ha) that was entered into the matrix. But on the official homepage of Dominion Farms it is stated that the company purchased an area of 17.000 acres which are 6879 ha.  2246 should be kept, but area size should be changed from 17.000 ha to 6879 ha. Additional link should be added: http://www.dominion-farms.com/operations.html .  The company website does not refer to Liberia, only Kenya. There is hardly information that Dominion Farms operates/wants to operate in Liberia, therefore the case was taken out |  |  |  | Case deleted = 1 |  |
| 1418 | Madagascar |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 1460 | Madagascar |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 2253 | Madagascar |  | This part of the Daewoo case is the aggregate area minus the failed sub area in 2254; See 106 | Failed 0 to 1; Investment size | 10.07.2012 | No effect (Fail) | Done. | Sources need to be added (see pdfs) |
| 2254 | Madagascar | Harry Verhoeven and Eckart Woertz on CNN website (July 9, 2012): “Yet, it reports deals that have never happened”  And  Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | Daewoo case that has raised a lot of attention and failed in parts due to resistance (the 2254 sub area of the contract definitely failed). | Failed 0 to 1 | 10.07.2012 | No effect (R=0) | Done. | Sources need to be added (see pdfs).  . |
| 1645 | Malawi | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (red block: “Incorrect area values”); **Comment**: “7,000 ha was acquired” (LM: 200000) | The GLP Report (that cited 20000 ha) quoted wrongly: its source said: “There are already 200,000 ha of jatropha in Malawi (…) *most* under the control of the UK-based company D1 Oils” (see 1645\_7: 2). Two sources (1645\_5 and 6) speak about **20000** ha, however they don’t name their sources and I have not found other reliable sources. The company itself doesn’t state the investment size. In a WB-study on Biofuels in Africa it is just said: “D1 Oils plc (D1), a U.K. share company (…) has produced jatropha oil for  export and domestic use since 2005. It is the world’s largest jatropha producer, with approximately 220,000 hectares of jatropha plantings on company-leased land and outgrowers’ farms in Asia and Africa. The  largest plantings are in India. It has ongoing activities in Malawi and Zambia in the African region.” Again, I asked Petrus about his source. His response: “D1 has acquired 7,000 ha - this data was provided to me from D1. Contact them directly I would say if you wish to reconfirm.” |  |  |  | Area size removed |  |
| 1646 | Malawi | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”)  Specific criticism: Still planned | The GLP report, the entry is based on, states that Djibouti at least has interest in an area of 50.000 ha not 55.000 ha. Might be that the investment is still just planned.  Area size of case 1646 should be changed to 50.000 ha. The reliability of case 1646 should be downgraded to 0 (GLP Report (based on articles??)). It should be highlighted that project has not started yet. |  |  |  | Area size changed; reliability=0; implementation status changed (=1) |  |
| 1648 | Malawi | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”)  Specific criticism: Still planned | I think Petrus assertion seems to be right, but the entry in the matrix does not list the project as started or even completed. The entry in the matrix does not contain information at all about the "status as reported" or "implementation status".  The reliability of case 1648 should be downgraded to 0 (only one newspaper article).  It should be highlighted more clearly that case 1648 is still just planned (state as reported; implementation status).  Link to GLP Report should be deleted, because it is concerning Lonrho’s involvement in Angola not Malawi. |  |  |  | Reliability=0; source deleted; Implementation status/state as reported changed (=1) |  |
| 1520 | Mali |  | Duplication of 1506 | Deleted | 18.05.2012 | No effect (R0) | “Case deleted” = 1  No information needed to be transferred, because case 1520 did not contain more information than case 1506. |  |
| 2267 | Mali | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of 1463. Case 2267 should be deleted. |  |  |  | Case deleted=1; information added |  |
| 1526 | Mozambique |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 1528 | Mozambique |  | On the official homepage of Deulco it is stated that the company is just developing areas for jatropha production in cooperation with other companies and then when the project is implemented the partner company takes over the investment area. But still Deulco seems to have two investment areas: one area of 1000 ha for maize production and one area of 15,000 ha for cattle. Source: <http://deulco.co.za/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=10&Itemid=12>. I would argue that case 1528 should be kept in the Matrix, even through it is necessary to review if the crop should be changed from jatropha to maize (the report of Spire states that the company is growing jatropha, while the company states it is growing maize). Another case should be added for Deulco refering to the area of 15,000 ha for cattle. | Reliability 0 (Tin) | ? (“last changes” by Tin) | Out | Reliability = 0 | See Note GIGA |
| 1560 | Mozambique |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 1574 | Mozambique |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 1575 | Mozambique |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 1582 | Mozambique | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | On the official homepage of Deulco it is stated that the company is just developing areas for jatropha production in cooperation with other companies and then when the project is implemented the partner company takes over the investment area. But still Deulco seems to have two investment areas: one area of 1000 ha for maiz production and one area of 15,000 ha for cattle. Source: <http://deulco.co.za/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=10&Itemid=12>  Case 1582 (1220 ha) is only reported by Oakland Report (reliable?? maybe reliability should be downgraded). | Reliability 0 (Tin) | ? (“last changes” by Tin) | out | Reliability = 0 | See Note GIGA |
| 1608 | Mozambique | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of 1575; Niqel is a subsidary of Dutch Jatropha Consortium. Source: <http://www.plaas.org.za/pubs/ldpi-working-papers-africa/LDPI01Andrew-vanVlaenderen.pdf>. Should be deleted | Deleted (Tin) | ? (“last changes” by Tin) | No effect (R=0) | Case deleted = 1 (there was no info to be transferred to the remaining case 1575) |  |
| 2283 | Mozambique | See case 1855 | See case 1855. Case 2283 was kept in the Matrix, but its investor was renamed EcoDevelopment in general Matrix | Taken out (Tin) | ? (“last changes” by Tin) | out | Investor name was renamed from Sekab to EcoDevelopment. |  |
| 2373 | Mozambique |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2375 | Mozambique |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2376 | Mozambique |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2377 | Mozambique |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2378 | Mozambique |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2379 | Mozambique |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2380 | Mozambique |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2381 | Mozambique |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2382 | Mozambique |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2383 | Mozambique |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2384 | Mozambique |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2385 | Mozambique |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2386 | Mozambique |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2387 | Mozambique |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2388 | Mozambique |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2389 | Mozambique |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2390 | Mozambique |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2391 | Mozambique |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2392 | Mozambique |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2393 | Mozambique |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 342 | Myanmar |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 | None (R 0) | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 1682 | Nigeria | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | The only accessible source the entry is based on, does not seem to belong to the case, it does not correspond with the information entered into the matrix. Furthermore it is a national company.  Case 1682 should be deleted or at least it’s reliability should be downgraded to 0. |  |  |  | Reliability=0 |  |
| 1686 | Nigeria | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of 1694; They even have the same source. The investor's name is spelled wrongly for case 1686. Should be deleted. |  |  |  | Case deleted=1; information added |  |
| 1697 | Nigeria | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | Duplication of 1696; ZJS International has two investments in two different regions, but together these two investment areas just comprise of 5000 ha. In that sense it is a double entry. It is not possible to find out how big the two areas are, it is just known that together they comprise 5000 ha. (See source: 1696\_1). Should be deleted;  But information listed under case 1697 should be added to case 1696. |  |  |  | Case deleted=1; information added |  |
| 379 | Pakistan |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 | None (R0) | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 403 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 414 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 415 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 416 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 417 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 418 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 419 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 420 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 421 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 423 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 424 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 425 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 426 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 427 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 428 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 429 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 430 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 437 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 438 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 442 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 447 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 448 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 455 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 456 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 457 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 458 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 459 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 460 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 465 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 466 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 471 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 476 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 477 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 480 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 484 | Philippines |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 2367 | Republic of Tanzania | See case 1855 | See case 1855. There is just one article listed as source. Case 2367 was kept in the Matrix.  The reliability of case 2367 should be listed as 0. | Reliability 0 (Tin) | ? (“last changes” by Tin) | No effect | Reliability = 0 |  |
| 1798 | Sierra Leone | I am writing to inquire about the entries (and omissions thereof) for Sierra Leone that appear in your database on land deals. As the chief researcher and writer of the Oakland Institute's report on large land deals in Sierra Leone, I am perplexed by the following:  1. The Land Matrix analytical report fails to reference the OI report on Sierra Leone, or the reports done by civil society groups (Right to Food Network, Green Scenery) on the Addax and Socfin land deals.  2. On the database, the best-known and documented land deals in Sierra Leone are absent, namely: Addax Bioenergy, Socfin, Quifel and also now SIVA Group (which has taken over the lease of Sierra Leone Agriculture). Yet the Addax deal is mentioned on a table in the analytical report, but not by name.  3. Do you mean Goldtree where you have "GoÃ© Tree"? If so, it is unclear why it is identified as from the UK, it is a subsidiary of Goldtree Holdings, which is sometimes reported to be US-based and sometimes Mauritius-based.  Joan Baxter [baxterjoan61@yahoo.com](mailto:baxterjoan61@yahoo.com)  Senior Fellow, Oakland Institute | * Addax Bioenergy (case ID 1798) is already entered into the Land MATRIX but the reliability ranking is 0. * The reliability ranking of this case should be increased. There is much confusion about how big the size of the investment really is (range 10.000 ha -26.000 ha). The company officially announced that it has a 10,000 ha plantation in Sierra Leone: * Following links should be added:   + <http://www.swedfund.se/wp-content/uploads/2012/05/Addax-Bioenergy-World-Bank-conference-on-Land-and-Poverty-26-April-2012.1.pdf>   + http://www.oaklandinstitute.org/sites/oaklandinstitute.org/files/OI\_SierraLeone\_Land\_Investment\_report\_0.pdf * Following links of the duplication entry (2365) should be added:   + <http://farmlandgrab.org/post/view/18025>   + <http://farmlandgrab.org/uploads/attachment/ADDAX%20MOU0001.pdf>   The reliability ranking of Addax Bioenergy (just case 1798, because the company officially announced that it has a 10,000 ha plantation in Sierra Leone) should be changed from 0 to 1. | Reliability 0 to 1  Source added | 24.05.2012 | in | Reliability changed to 1;  Links of duplications and additional links were added. | and maybe investment size should be changed to 20000. |
| 1798 | Sierra Leone | Emaill von Peter Messerli, CDE, 10.07.2012 | Swiss case raising a lot of public attention in Switzerland. | Investment Size | 09.07.2012 | Size | Done. Size changed. | Sources (see Email) need to be added |
| 1807 | Sierra Leone | See 1798. | * Quifel is already entered into the Land MATRIX but the reliability ranking is 0. * The reliability ranking of this case should be increased to 1 because the information is taken from a research paper based on field research. * Following links should be added:   + http://www.oaklandinstitute.org/sites/oaklandinstitute.org/files/OI\_SierraLeone\_Land\_Investment\_report\_0.pdf | Reliability 0 to 1  Source added  Investment size added | 24.05.2012 | in | Reliability changed to 1;  Source added (🡪 References (temp), column “Internetlink B”) | Investment size not yet added: The OI-Report states 126000 ha ? |
| 1817 | Sierra Leone | Joan Baxter baxterjoan61@yahoo.com  Senior Fellow, Oakland Institute  Do you mean Goldtree where you have "GoÃ© Tree"? If so, it is unclear why it is identified as from the UK, it is a subsidiary of Goldtree Holdings, which is sometimes reported to be US-based and sometimes Mauritius-based. | Yes “Goöd Tree” has to be changed to “Gold Tree” (case ID 1817). The source on which the entry into the Land MATRIX is based states that Gold Tree is a company from UK (http://www.wrm.org.uy/countries/Africa/Oil\_Palm\_in\_Africa.pdf. Another source; Sierra Express states that Gold Tree is a subsidiary of Goldtree Holdings, which is a Mauritian company owned by investors from the United Kingdom (http://www.sierraexpressmedia.com/archives/12197).  The investor’s name of case 1817 should be changed to “Gold Tree”, the company’s origin country should stay UK. |  |  |  | Name of Investor was changed to “Gold Tree”.  Into the field “Remarks Regarding Size” the following was entered: 30000 smallholder oil palm planting, 800 ha plantation.  Into the field  “Specific Location” the following was entered: Daru, Kailahun District.  Following link of official homepage was entered: http://www.goldtreeholdings.com/operations. | Maybe the name should even be changed to “Gold Tree Holding”  Shall a project of which a large part is smallholder oriented really be listed in the MATRIX? |
| 2356 | Sierra Leone | See 1798. | Duplication of 1798 | deleted | 24.05.2012 | No effect (R0) | “Case deleted” = 1  **Following information were transferred from case 2356 to case 1798:**  “Other remarks regarding the investment”: “Phase 2 2013-2015, estimated investment: 300 mio Euro, estimated labour 4000” added. |  |
| 2371 | Sierra Leone |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2372 | Sierra Leone |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 3003 | Sierra Leone |  | New case (Andrea) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 3004 | Sierra Leone |  | New case (Andrea) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In |  |  |
| 3005 | Sierra Leone |  | New case (Andrea) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In |  |  |
| 3006 | Sierra Leone |  | New case (Andrea) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In |  |  |
| 3007 | Sierra Leone |  | New case (Andrea) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In |  |  |
| 3008 | Sierra Leone |  | New case (Andrea) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In |  |  |
| 3009 | Sierra Leone |  | New case (Andrea) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In |  |  |
| 3010 | Sierra Leone |  | New case (Andrea) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In |  |  |
| 3013 | Sierra Leone |  | New case (Andrea) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In |  |  |
| 3014 | Sierra Leone |  | New case (Andrea) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In |  |  |
| 3015 | Sierra Leone |  | New case (Andrea) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In |  |  |
| 3016 | Sierra Leone |  | New case (Andrea) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In |  |  |
| 1744 | South Sudan | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (red block: “Incorrect area values”); **Comment**: “400,000 ha was signed for - no official lease though” (LM: 800000) | Petrus is right: according to Norwegian People’s Aid, Jarch Management non officially (the “lease does not have any official recognition from the government”, see 1744\_4: 27) leased **400,000** ha from a Sudanese company called Leac for Agriculture, Ltd (source: the 2010 statistical yearbook for Southern Sudan) – a deal for another 400,000 hectares is in the process of negotiation, see 1744\_4: 21). Concerning this last point, I have not found more current information.  Since 400000 are taken over “officially”, the size should be corrected to 400000. Moreover, the country should be changed into South Sudan. |  |  |  | Size changed to 400000; country changed |  |
| 2394 | South Sudan |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2299 | Sudan |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 2302 | Sudan |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 1842 | Tanzania | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) ;  FIAN: error concerning the name of investor: The name of investor is not written uniformly for different deals | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  |  |  |
| 1855 | Tanzania | Sekab no longer has an interest in this investment. It sold its assets to EcoDevelopment. This is clearly stated in one of the sources you cite, the CHRGJ Land Report. You cite SEKAB throughout the Matrix, when it no longer has such interests as far as I can see. And there is no mention of EcoDevelopment anywhere.  <http://landportal.info/landmatrix/get-the-detail/by-investor/973>  Anonymous | * Duplication of 2366. * “EcoDevelopment In Europe AB (EcoDevelopment)” of Sweden acquired the entire share capital of Sekab Bioenergy Tanzania Limited . * Planned deals with high hectare size numbers were Sekab’s plans for investments. EcoDevelopment only took over the existing and much smaller areas (one investment of 22.000 ha and one of 200 ha)   LINK ( sources Tanzania) | deleted | 24.05.2012 | out | “Case deleted” = 1 |  |
| 1856 | Tanzania | See 1855 | See 1855 | deleted | 24.05.2012 | out | “Case deleted” = 1 |  |
| 1857 | Tanzania | See 1855 | See 1855 | deleted | 24.05.2012 | out | “Case deleted” = 1 |  |
| 1877 | Tanzania |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 1878 | Tanzania |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 1879 | Tanzania |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 1891 | Tanzania |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 1895 | Tanzania | See 1855 | Should be kept and renamed from Sekab to EcoDevelopment.  Following link should be added:  http://www.tanzanialandportal.org/index.php?option=com\_jdownloads&Itemid=64&view=finish&cid=28&catid=4 | No change: was kept in Online Matrix. |  |  | Additional link was added.  The investor was renamed from “Sekab” to “EcoDevelopment”.  Information of duplication entries transferred:  “Processing/Use of Produce 1”: was changed from “AGF” to “ETH”. | . |
| 1896 | Tanzania | See 1855 | See 1855 | deleted | 24.05.2012 | out | “Case deleted” = 1 |  |
| 2365 | Tanzania | See 1855 | Duplication of 2367; see 1855 | deleted | 24.05.2012 | No effect (R0) | “Case deleted” = 1;  Link (PDF 2367\_2) saved (🡪 References (temp), column “Internetlink B”) |  |
| 2366 | Tanzania | See 1855 | Case 2366 should be kept in the Matrix. Information of duplicate entries should be transferred to this case.  • Following links of the duplication entries should be added:  •http://pubs.iied.org/pdfs/12560IIED.pdf  •http://www.umweltbuero-klagenfurt.at/sos/wp-content/uploads/Teilbericht\_4a\_Biomasse\_Exner\_Schlussversion.pdf  Furthermore following link should be added:  •http://www.oaklandinstitute.org/sites/oaklandinstitute.org/files/OI\_country\_report\_tanzania.pdf | No change: was kept in Online Matrix |  |  | Links of duplication entries and additional links were entered.  Information of duplication entries transferred:  “Reliability Ranking”: “1” added.  “Specific Location”: changed to “Pwani, Bagamoyo, Razaba Ranch”  “Spatial Code”: “5eefbf33-31da-4472-73cf-c0f056902b89” added.  “Coordinates”: “(-6.445776, 38.899601)” added.  “State as Reported”: changed from “1” to “2”.  “Implementation Status”: “3” added.  “Produce exported”: “no” deleted.  “Water Extraction Envisaged”: “Yes” added.  “Benefits for Local Communities”: “D (Out-grower schemes, subcontracts)” added.  “Former Predominant Land Owner”: “A (State)” added.  “Former Predominant Land User”: “F (Pasture)” added |  |
| 2395 | Tanzania |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2396 | Tanzania |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2397 | Tanzania |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2398 | Tanzania |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2399 | Tanzania |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 500 | Thailand |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 504 | Thailand |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 1958 | Uganda |  | See 106 | Failed 0 to 1 | 04.07.2012 |  | Nothing to be done. |  |
| 2201 | Uganda | http://www.chinaafricarealstory.com/2012/04/zombie-chinese-land-grabs-in-africa.html  Hubei multipurpose project. A big talking entrepreneur and one media story. This never went anywhere. Zombie ... zombie .. | The GIZ Report states that 40,500 ha are planed, but the contract has only been signed for 1000 ha, with further operations planed. As well another source which calls the company Hebei states that the company will only cultivate crops on 1000 acres and plans to grow operations to about 40,500 ha of land in 8-10 years.  Sometimes the company is called heibei, sometimes Hebei.  Additional source: FIAN: http://www.fian.at/assets/FIAN\_Landnahme\_Uganda\_final\_web.pdf. Also states that Heibei invested in 40,500 ha, but maybe they just repeated the error??  Another additional source Grain Landgrab deals (<http://es.scribd.com/doc/93019302/29/Tanzania>)  states that Hebei Company told the Observer that it will cultivate crops on around 500 ha and plans to grow operations to about 40,500 ha of land.  I do not find clear information in the internet weather the investment was carried out or was canceled.  What seems to be clear is that there was no contract about 40,500 ha singed, if there was a contract signed at all then just about 500 to 1000 ha.  Reliability of case 2201 should be downgraded to 0. |  |  |  | Reliability=0 |  |
| 3017 | Uganda |  | New case (Andrea) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In |  |  |
| 3018 | Uganda |  | New case (Andrea) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In |  |  |
| 3019 | Uganda |  | New case (Andrea) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In |  |  |
| 3020 | Uganda |  | New case (Andrea) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In |  |  |
| 1841 | United Republic of Tanzania |  | Double entry of case 1846. Case 1841 is already reliability 0, should be deleted. | Deleted (Tin) | ? (“last changes” by Tin) | No effect (R=0) | Case deleted =1; |  |
| 1844 | United Republic of Tanzania |  | Double entry of case 1846. Case 1844 is already reliability 0, should be deleted. | Deleted (Tin) | ? (“last changes” by Tin) | No effect (R=0) | Case deleted =1; |  |
| 1845 | United Republic of Tanzania |  | Double entry of case 1846. Case 1845 is already reliability 0, should be deleted. | Deleted (Tin) | ? (“last changes” by Tin) | No effect (R=0) | Case deleted =1; |  |
| 1881 | United Republic of Tanzania | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”)  Specific criticism: The Kapunga Rice project is the one run by ETC. | Maybe Petrus means that case 1881 is a duplication of case 1930 (Kapunga Rice Project). I cannot determine whether this criticism is justified, because there is no link entered into the Matrix ( just following comment:Korogwe District, Land Registry ; Mkomazi Village, minutes of village council meetings). I do not find further information in the internet either. (Case 1881 should maybe be deleted) | Reliability 0 (Tin) | ? (“last changes” by Tin) | out | Reliability = 0 | If double entries – information needs to be transferred to remaining case |
| 1889 | United Republic of Tanzania | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”)  Specific criticism: This is the owner of ETC and the Kapunga Rice project | The criticism of Petrus seems to be right, the company on its homepage states that it has only one property to grow rice in Tanzania (8000 ha) and this property seems to be the Kapunga Rice Project. But there is no link entered into the Matrix ( just following comment: "PhD Dissertation "The land question revisited: Tanzania 1987 - 2007" approved 25.3.2010, L'Orientale Naples" and "Fieldwork notes - Kapunga village"). (Maybe case 1881 and case 1930 should be deleted; and for case 1889 the size of the investment should be changed to 8000 ha; following link to the official homepage should be added: <http://www.etgworld.com/operations/farming/>; sources of case 1930 should be added to case 1889) | Reliability 0 (Tin) | ? (“last changes” by Tin) | out | Reliability = 0 | See Note GIGA |
| 1891 | United Republic of Tanzania | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | 1891 is a double entry of case 1842. Furthermore the Oakland Institute and WWF (Source: http://www.wwf.se/source.php/1203701/WWF\_Tanzania\_Scoping\_Report\_Biofuels.pdf) report that D1 Oils has abandoned its plans for Tanzania – failed deal – see above. Case 1891 should be deleted | Deleted (Tin) | ? (“last changes” by Tin) | No effect (R=0) | Case deleted =1; |  |
| 1899 | United Republic of Tanzania | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | 1899 is a duplication of case 1882. Case 1899 should be deleted. | Deleted (Tin) | ? (“last changes” by Tin) | No effect (R=0) | Case deleted =1; | Information needs to be transferred from 1899 to 1882 |
| 1902 | United Republic of Tanzania | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (red block: “Incorrect area values”); **Comment**: “Agrisol acquired 13,725 ha” (LM: 25000) | Diverging information: The Oakland Institute Papers (1902\_1 and 2) just indicate that the *site of Lugufu* (project area) encompasses 25000 ha (see e.g. 1902\_1: 1) and in its presentation AgriSol talks about a “potential production size” of about 25000 ha (1902\_3: slide 17).  **Apparently the size of the concession is** **not yet clear**: in a guest column (dated February 24, 2012) Bruce Rastetter (co-founder and managing director of AgriSol Energy) said: “Our prospective project in Lugufu consists of about 34,000 acres” (1902\_5) and AgriSol on its website states it was “currently planning to develop two tracts of land in Kigoma, in western Tanzania, of approximately 10,500 hectares at Lugufu, and an additional 3,250 hectares, near Lugufu, north of Basanza village. We anticipate starting development of these tracts in 2012” (1902\_6) – I have not found more current data. Size should be left open and added when an agreement is made / Petrus should be asked about his source | Taken out (Tin) | ? (“last changes” by Tin) | out |  |  |
| 1914 | United Republic of Tanzania | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”) | First of all, 1914 is a double entry of 1867. Secondly, Petrus’ criticism is justified Diligent does not own plantations, it is an outgrower scheme. Case 1914 should be deleted. | Deleted (Tin) | ? (“last changes” by Tin) | No effect (R=0) | Case deleted =1; | Information needs to be transferred from 1914 to 1867 |
| 1930 | United Republic of Tanzania | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (dark red cases: “incorrect information”)  Specific criticism: This is the owner of ETC and the Kapunga Rice project | Seems to be a double entry of case 1889. (Case 1930 should maybe be deleted) | Reliability 0 (Tin) | ? (“last changes” by Tin) | out | Reliability = 0 | If double entry – information needs to be transferred to remaining case |
| 1933 | United Republic of Tanzania |  | Double entry of case 1846. Case 1933 is already reliability 0, should be deleted. | Deleted (Tin) | ? (“last changes” by Tin) | No effect (R=0) | Case deleted =1; |  |
| 1945 | United Republic of Tanzania | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | 1945, 1946, 1947 seem to be double entries. There are no sources available concerning these 3 cases. Reliability should be downgraded to 0 | Reliability 0 (Tin) | ? (“last changes” by Tin) | out | Reliability = 0 | If double entries – information needs to be transferred to remaining case |
| 1946 | United Republic of Tanzania | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | 1945, 1946, 1947 seem to be double entries. There are no sources available concerning these 3 cases. Reliability should be downgraded to 0 | Reliability 0 (Tin) | ? (“last changes” by Tin) | out | Reliability = 0 | If double entries – information needs to be transferred to remaining case |
| 1947 | United Republic of Tanzania | Petrus: excel file “land-matrix-data-errors2.xlsx” (blue cases: “duplications”) | 1945, 1946, 1947 seem to be double entries. There are no sources available concerning these 3 cases. Reliability should be downgraded to 0 | Reliability 0 (Tin) | ? (“last changes” by Tin) | out | Reliability = 0 | If double entries – information needs to be transferred to remaining case |
| 1949 | United Republic of Tanzania |  | Double entry of case 1893. Case 1949should be deleted | Deleted (Tin) | ? (“last changes” by Tin) | No effect (R=0) | Case deleted =1; | Information needs to be transferred from 1949 to 1893! |
| 2364 | United Republic of Tanzania |  | Double entry of case 1846. Case 2364 is already reliability 0, should be deleted. | Deleted (Tin) | ? (“last changes” by Tin) | No effect (R=0) | Case deleted =1; | Information needs to be transferred from 2364 to 1846! |
| 2023 | Zambia |  | Duplication of 1733 | Deleted | 18.05.2012 | No effect (R0) |  | Really duplicates? (appear very differently) |
| 2045 | Zambia |  | Duplication of 2326 | Deleted | 18.05.2012 | No effect (R0) |  | Really duplicates? (different target countries, area sizes and investor information) |
| 2052 | Zambia |  | Duplication of 1833 | Deleted | 18.05.2012 | out |  | Really duplicates? (different target countries) |
| 2400 | Zimbabwe |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |
| 2401 | Zimbabwe |  | New case (Anne) | Sent to Tin | 30.05.2012 | In | Fully included |  |